**Logo

Description automatically generated**

**Incline Village/Crystal Bay Citizen Advisory Board**

Minutes of the regular meeting of the Incline Village/Crystal Bay Citizen Advisory Board held on ***March 25, 2024***, at 5:30 p.m. at 845 Alder Ave., Incline Village, Nevada 89451

1. **CALL TO ORDER/ DETERMINATION OF QUORUM**

PRESENT - Kevin Lyons, Roxanna Dunn, Chris Wood, Denise Davis, Diane Becker

ABSENT - Carla Werner (At-Large Alternate)

A quorum was established, and the meeting was brought to order.

1. **PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE**

The pledge of allegiance was recited.

1. **GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT**

Shawn Comstock expressed concerns about item 7 regarding a fire evacuation route. She highlighted the dangers of placing two private schools within one block on Mount Rose Highway, each intending to host 120 students. She noted the proximity to a truck ramp, which has seen accidents, including fatalities and a recent truck incident. Shawn opposed the plan, citing a report from Dell Engineering indicating no impact, which she disputes, and presented a 50-person petition from neighbors against the proposal. Comstock also mentioned the challenges of evacuating students and residents during an emergency due to narrow roads without sidewalks, impeding emergency vehicle access.

1. **ANNOUNCEMENTS FROM COMMISSIONER HILL**

Commission Chair Alexis Hill announced that she and the County Manager recently engaged with Incline Village and Crystal Bay residents at the IVCBA annual meeting, where Manager Brown presented on the County's contributions to the community. She suggested sharing this presentation at a future CAB meeting. Hill also mentioned that Kelly Echeverria, in collaboration with Chief Summers, is working on estimating peak populations and sewer loads in Incline Village/Crystal Bay to improve evacuation planning. Hill emphasized that the County takes residents' concerns seriously and appreciated the ongoing dialogue about the community's needs.

CAB Chair Diane Becker asked whether the email from Linda Offerdahl’s group regarding a series of workshops had speakers provided by the County or if they were separate. Chair Hill believes Linda is getting separate speakers but may be County speakers depending on the results of the survey that Chair Hill encouraged the CAB and residents to take. An example would be having Planning staff come present on code amendments.

Diane Becker asked Alexis to help bring speakers regarding workforce housing to the CAB, as well as the Reno Housing Authority (RHA). Chair Hill acknowledged the request.

Kevin Lyons asked for the content of the presentation that County Manager Brown gave to the IVCBA. Chair Hill remarked that the presentation was an update on all the good things Washoe County has been up to in the Washoe Tahoe area – like snow removal, investments into that community, and potential for a Leadership Academy up at the lake. Diane agreed that it would be good to see that item on the agenda. Chair Hill offered to send the presentation to the CAB Chair to review and determine if it should be on the CAB agenda.

1. **PUBLIC SAFETY UPDATES**

Washoe County Sheriff Office Lieutenant Colacurcio noted that the Sheriff’s Office has released the “2023 State of the Sheriff” Report, available on their website. The Incline substation remains stable with 16 deputies. Additionally, there are two new school resource officers. The new Captain, Amelia Galicia, will be involved and available in future meetings to address community concerns.

Denise Davis [inaudible – prompts the Lieutenant to talk about Sheriff’s Office collaboration on a fundraiser]. In response, Lt. Colacurcio mentioned that Sheriff's Office is collaborating on a fundraiser for the Special Olympics on May 4th, their biggest fundraiser of the year. Ninety-one cents of every dollar raised goes towards medical care and education for individuals with intellectual disabilities. The event will be held at 9:30 AM at Round Hill Pines in South Lake Tahoe, a great venue for this cause.

Chief Ryan Sommers noted being status quo for the moment with no further update.

1. **COMMUNITY BROADBAND PROJECTS**

Behzad Zamanian presented information on various connectivity types such as 800 MHz radio systems used by public safety personnel, cellular networks, and broadband. He explained the differences and functionalities of each type, noting that the county has limited control over cellular networks, which are managed by companies like Verizon, AT&T, and T-Mobile. Behzad encouraged community members to check coverage maps and switch providers if needed.

Zamanian detailed the county’s efforts to upgrade the 800 MHz radio system to the P25 standard, enhancing interoperability and compatibility. He highlighted ongoing projects to improve radio sites in the region, with completion expected by the end of next year. He emphasized that public safety radio systems in Incline Village have performed reliably without major issues.

Regarding broadband, Zamanian described the types of broadband (DSL, cable modem, fiber, wireless, satellite) and the County’s master plan to improve connectivity, focusing on rural areas. The first project successfully connected Gerlach to high-speed internet, and phase two aims to provide fiber to homes in Gerlach and Empire. Future projects will address connectivity in North Valleys, Warm Springs, and Washoe Valley, pending funding.

Zamanian also mentioned the [FCC’s broadband map](about:blank), allowing residents to check service availability and challenge inaccurate provider claims. He encouraged community participation in the challenge process to ensure accurate data, which helps secure funding for broadband projects.

Diane Becker inquired whether the 800 MHz system used for emergency communications was available to the public, to which Behzad Zamanian clarified that it is limited to government agencies, primarily for first responders. Diane also raised concerns about communication reliability during disasters, like those seen in Hawaii, particularly asking about backup radio systems. Behzad confirmed the availability of multiple communication methods and recommended radio as the most stable option. Diane further highlighted the lack of cellular coverage on key evacuation routes, prompting Behzad to plan internal discussions on how the County might collaborate with cellular companies to improve service in these areas.

Kevin Lyons expressed concern that the County may inadvertently create barriers to the establishment of cell sites, potentially contributing to dead spots in coverage. He suggested researching how often applications for cell sites have been denied or faced challenges in the past 5-10 years. Kevin shared insights into the process of site selection and the difficulties that can arise, such as community resistance based on misconceptions about cell towers. Behzad Zamanian agreed to investigate these issues, including potential amendments to streamline the process and address the concerns raised.

Roxanna Dunn raised a concern about the potential environmental impact of cell phone towers, specifically regarding a coating on the towers that could come off and pollute nearby lakes. She questioned whether there were alternatives to these coatings, possibly with less environmental risk, even if they result in less aesthetically pleasing towers. Behzad Zamanian acknowledged the concern and noted that this would be a question for cellular providers. He committed to including this issue in his internal discussions to explore potential solutions or alternatives.

Chris Wood asked about the approval process for a Verizon cell tower being installed at the top of Tunnel Creek in Incline Village, questioning who has authority over such decisions. Behzad Zamanian explained that while the FCC regulates the telecommunications industry, local permits and approvals, possibly involving multiple agencies like BLM, are required for such installations. Chris then inquired why cellular providers don’t collaborate to use a single tower to serve all carriers instead of each building their own. Behzad noted that while providers sometimes collaborate, they generally prefer to own their own sites, leading to multiple towers in a given area. Chris expressed regret over the inefficiency of having multiple towers where one might suffice. Kevin Lyons chimed in that it depends on the situation and that often location providers will identify locations that can support multiple providers and negotiate with the owner. TRPA may even have a say in this. Chris Wood questioned whether the Tahoe Regional Planning Agency (TRPA) should address concerns about metallic or plastic materials on cell towers, which could pose environmental risks. Behzad Zamanian agreed that it could be an issue for TRPA to consider, though he noted that he needs to become more familiar with the specific concerns. Behzad mentioned his intention to collaborate internally with the Community Services Department, emergency management, and other relevant entities to review all radio and cellular sites under the County's jurisdiction, aiming to gather more comprehensive information and explore potential solutions.

Chief Ryan Sommers discussed the challenges in getting cell towers approved in the area, noting that while the County has generally supported these proposals, public opposition during the planning process often leads to their rejection. Kevin Lyons followed up by asking for clarification on the process, questioning whether the planning process typically approves these towers only for them to be later overturned by county commissioners due to public outcry. Chief Sommers confirmed that public comments, particularly from residents in Incline Village and Crystal Bay, have played a significant role in the rejection of these projects, despite initial support from the County. He then deferred to Commissioner Alexis Hill for further explanation.

Commissioner Hill elaborated that a cell tower proposal in Incline Village was indeed rejected following significant public opposition, which contributed to the decision. She also noted that the Tahoe Regional Planning Agency (TRPA) is currently working on updating requirements for cell towers, including developing better designs that are both aesthetically and environmentally friendly. Alexis acknowledged the ongoing communication issues in areas like Highway 28 between Incline Village and Crystal Bay and agreed that the County should explore using its properties for future cell towers to improve connectivity and ensure public safety during emergencies.

Diane Becker added to the discussion by referencing a specific case from 2018 or 2019 where a proposed cell tower on a village walking path was blocked due to safety concerns under TRPA rules. She emphasized the need for the community to understand that if they want better emergency connectivity, they might need to compromise on the placement of towers. Diane also suggested that the County consider offering its own sites for tower placements, given the challenges that cell companies face in finding suitable locations.

Yolanda Knaak raised several concerns about emergency communication and evacuation plans. She noted that the CodeRED mobile alert system, which she has on her phone, does not work if the phone is off, contrary to what she was initially told. She also highlighted the issue of losing Verizon connectivity when driving through Crystal Bay on Highway 28. Additionally, she inquired about the status of a proposal from Chief Sommers regarding emergency sirens, asking what became of that initiative. Finally, Yolanda questioned whether the evacuation plan had been updated, pointing out that the last version she saw did not account for visitors, which she found problematic in the event of a fire.

Helen Neff expressed concerns about the reliability of Spectrum as her sole internet provider, noting frequent outages that sometimes last all day. She asked about options for recourse, sharing her frustration with Spectrum's minimal compensation for service interruptions. Behzad Zamanian suggested using the FCC or Nevada Broadband websites to file a challenge or complaint, which could prompt a response from either the FCC or the state’s Office of Science, Innovation, and Technology. Helen asked if the challenge process could address substandard service, to which Behzad confirmed that it could be used for this purpose, depending on the type of challenge submitted.

Helen also shared information she received from the fire department, stating that all radio stations in an area must switch to emergency broadcasts during a crisis, meaning any station with a signal would provide emergency information. Additionally, she mentioned that the TRPA does review cell tower proposals, as she has seen them on the Hearing Officer agenda for areas like the South and West Shores.

Pamela Mahoney Tsigdinos raised several questions regarding data access, alternative communication technologies, and collaboration on emergency planning. She first inquired whether the County could obtain data from cellular providers about the number of people entering and exiting the Tahoe Basin, particularly during peak periods. Behzad Zamanian explained that while cellular companies do collect and sell such data, the County does not have direct access to it, unless it's related to public safety or criminal investigations. Pamela then asked about the potential use of ham radio as a reliable communication method during emergencies, given its ability to function despite fire, heat, or smoke that could disrupt other technologies. Behzad acknowledged the effectiveness of ham radios but pointed out their limited range and noted that public safety radios, which operate on a similar principle but with greater reliability and range, are currently used by the County. Finally, Pamela suggested that Washoe County collaborate with the University of Nevada, Reno (UNR) to develop innovative solutions tailored to the unique challenges of the Tahoe Basin, particularly concerning evacuation strategies. Behzad expressed interest in this idea, mentioning his involvement with a community group focused on broadband in Nevada and the exploration of new technologies, such as wireless mini towers, that could improve connectivity in the Tahoe area. He agreed to consider reaching out to UNR for further collaboration on these issues. Pamela also mentioned concerns about AT&T's lead cables in the lake and suggested the County might influence their removal, although this was not directly addressed by Behzad.

Tim Delaney raised concerns about communication infrastructure and fire safety in Incline Village. He suggested that the community should consider a multi-layered approach to communication, including space-based systems like Elon Musk’s StarLink, alongside traditional methods such as cellular and ham radio. Tim emphasized the importance of having multiple backup systems to ensure reliable communication during emergencies. He also highlighted the need to focus on forest management to prevent situations where evacuation becomes necessary, suggesting that maintaining high canopies and thinning trees could help firemen control wildfires more effectively, thereby reducing the likelihood of mass evacuations and casualties, as seen in past disasters like Paradise and the recent fires in Hawaii. Tim concluded by mentioning the recent decision by State Farm to halt insurance in parts of California due to fire risks, warning that similar issues could arise in Nevada, including Incline Village.

1. **EVACUATION RESIDENT INPUT**

CAB Chair Diane Becker introduced an agenda item regarding resident input on evacuation plans. She explained that a draft letter was created with contributions from several community members, including Roxanna Dunn, Doug Flaherty and Margaret Martini, following a previous meeting where they gathered public comments. The letter is intended to be sent to the Emergency Management Administrator, Kelly Echeverria, to convey the community's recommendations on evacuation procedures. Diane emphasized the urgency of sending the letter during the current budgeting process, proposing that the CAB either approve the letter with or without changes or postpone action, which she advised against, as it could result in missing the opportunity to influence the budget.

Roxanna Dunn provided several revisions: Item #3 - Clarifying that the term "winter ski season" might be confusing without additional context. Item #14 - Correction to the maximum vehicle capacity, noting it should be 13,900 instead of 14,000, and offered to provide the reference for this figure. Item #16 - Proposed incorporating evacuation levels, such as alert, optional evacuation, and mandatory evacuation, into community training. Roxanna emphasized the importance of educating the public on what is allowed during different evacuation stages, particularly noting that trailers and boats should not be used during mandatory evacuations to ensure efficient evacuations. Diane Becker disagreed in that the CAB should not be dictating training – that the goal is to get Emergency Management to consider these items. Roxanna remarked that she has heard of different evacuation levels on the radio and that education surrounding that might be helpful. Diane and Roxanna discussed rewording a section of the evacuation letter related to modeling worst-case scenarios. They agreed to simplify the wording by including "peak seasons" and mentioning "winter ski season" more generally. Roxanna noted she wasn’t particularly concerned about evacuations during the winter ski season, but Diane pointed out the relevance of other emergencies, like earthquakes, during that time. They settled on keeping "peak winter ski season" for clarity.

Chris Wood addressed an inaccuracy he perceived in bullet point #3 of the letter, which referred to "added evacuation demands caused in part by decisions of the Board of County Commissioners favoring higher, denser, and more concentrated residential construction." He clarified that, to his knowledge, the Washoe County Board of Commissioners had not yet voted on such matters. Chris suggested revising the statement to attribute these decisions to the Tahoe Regional Planning Agency (TRPA) instead, unless someone could confirm that the Board of Commissioners had made such decisions. Diane Becker suggested that the language change to “governmental bodies”, to which all other CAB members agreed.

Chris Wood raised concerns about the accuracy of paragraph 5 in the draft letter, which requests the County to analyze evacuation risks related to plans for a town center and special area zoning. He clarified that, to his knowledge, Washoe County has not made any decisions on increasing population density tied to these plans. While a special area zoning amendment was made in January 2023 to allow for single-family and affordable housing, Chris pointed out that there is no clear evidence this will increase population density. Additionally, he noted that the County has not yet voted on TRPA's proposed regulations for higher, denser construction and zero parking. Chris proposed rewording the paragraph to focus on analyzing evacuation risks tied to TRPA's plans, if they result in increased population density in Incline Village. Diane Becker responded by suggesting a rewording of the paragraph to focus on analyzing evacuation risks tied to the town center and special area zoning. She proposed including both "approved" and "under consideration" zoning changes for Washoe County and Incline Village. Diane explained that the zoning changes, such as allowing higher buildings and potential luxury condos, could impact population density. She emphasized that the analysis should address these potential developments, while making it clear that the focus is on governmental bodies relevant to Washoe County and the Incline Village area.

Kevin Lyons expressed concern about the draft letter becoming less impactful if it includes too many minor or weak claims. He suggested that when presenting the 20 bullet points, it should be clear that these are comments passed along from others, rather than necessarily being endorsed by the group. Kevin emphasized the importance of focusing on the serious issues, rather than diluting the message with less significant points that might detract from addressing the bigger problems. Diane Becker explained that she felt that she could not reject any contributions but acknowledged the need to clarify that the bullet points came from public input. She proposed adjusting the phrasing in the letter to state that "CAB members and the public in attendance created the suggestions below, which we are forwarding accurately." Chris Wood added that the wording should specify that the suggestions are being forwarded "as spoken by the public and CAB members." Diane agreed and suggested making this clarification stand out as a separate sentence to ensure it was clear that the ideas were sourced from attendees.

Roxanna Dunn added that bullet point #14 should be changed to “in July 2023, NDOT reported an average of 18,000 vehicles.

Shawn Comstock, spoke about the potential evacuation risks tied to the rezoning of Mount Rose Highway into a school zone. She explained that this rezoning, already approved by the County and now under review by TRPA for special use permits, could impact evacuation plans. She cited a report from an engineering firm stating that the proposed development would not significantly affect congestion or emergency response times. However, Shawn expressed concerns that the proposed schools—kindergarten through high school—could create serious evacuation issues, especially with parents trying to pick up children during an emergency. Shawn warned that without proper infrastructure, such as turn lanes, the area risks becoming overwhelmed during an evacuation, potentially leading to a disaster similar to the Paradise Fire.

Yolanda Knaak questioned the complaints about schools causing congestion, noting that more people attend church services on a Sunday morning than would be at the schools during weekdays. She then shared an idea she had previously discussed with Chief Summers about reopening Old Mount Rose Highway to aid in evacuations. While it wouldn’t help evacuate people out of the basin, it could assist those trying to get down the mountain on the other side. Though this would require Congressional action, Yolanda mentioned that her congressman showed interest. She concluded by noting that reopening Old Mount Rose could be useful during ski season when the area might experience both a fire and active ski traffic, as conditions can vary at different elevations.

Chief Ryan Sommers asked for clarification on the draft letter's first item, which referred to hiring a "fire expert." He wanted to ensure the intent was not to bring in someone to advise on fighting fires but rather on evacuation strategies. Diane Becker clarified that the intention was to hire an expert in fire evacuation, someone with experience in helping similar mountain communities develop evacuation plans. Diane emphasized the importance of finding a neutral, qualified consultant to assist with evacuation planning, not fire suppression. Ryan suggested rewording it to "disaster evacuation expert," and Diane agreed, acknowledging his point.

Tim Delaney emphasized the need for a professional with an engineering background, specifically someone who understands disaster evacuation and has experience with fire dynamics, rather than a legal expert. He pointed out that the population in the area is expected to increase due to the growth of businesses like kayak and e-bike rentals, along with TRPA's plans to bring more visitors into the region. He stressed that these changes would complicate evacuation efforts. Tim also raised concerns about the ornamental trees in Incline Village, describing them as fire hazards, and urged the group to consider how wind and fire conditions could quickly lead to a catastrophe.

Diane Becker suggested revising paragraph one to say, "retain a disaster expert" instead of a "fire and evacuation expert." Additionally, she recommended adding a section under item #19 to investigate alternative evacuation routes, such as fire trails and the Old Mount Rose Highway. Diane also proposed a new item, #21, to analyze the impact of rezoning Highway 431 as a school zone and how it could affect evacuation efforts.

Motion by Roxanna Dunn to accept letter with proposed amendments and to send it to Kelly Echeverria, Emergency Management Administrator. Seconded by Diane Becker (Motion carried 5-0)

1. **NEIGHBORHOOD DEVELOPMENT HUB**

Alexandra Wilson, Commissioner Support Team, announced that the St. Claire's Neighborhood Development meeting had been canceled. The cancellation was due to multiple public comments noting a scheduling conflict with a TRPA meeting and another neighborhood development meeting on the same day. She reassured the public that a new meeting date would be scheduled soon to ensure everyone has an opportunity to participate.

1. **BOARD MEMBER ANNOUNCEMENTS/REQUESTS/DISCUSSION**

Roxanna Dunn updated on recent meetings with County Commissioners, covering evacuation, workforce housing, and short-term rentals (STRs). For evacuation, IV/CB CAB presenters asked for funding for a comprehensive plan, but concerns were raised about budget limits and a Nevada law restricting evacuation considerations in development. On workforce housing, they highlighted the need for local essential workers and interest in using the Low-Income Housing Tax Credit, though they can't provide cost estimates due to budget constraints. Regarding STRs, Roxanna stressed their negative impact on neighborhoods and transit goals, noting that if a cap proposal was revisited with strong community support, the Board might consider it.

Diane Becker, following Roxanna’s update, emphasized that public safety, particularly evacuation, was the top priority in their meetings with the Commissioners, while short-term rentals (STRs) were considered less urgent. However, they noted that two Commissioners who were initially not expected to be receptive to the STR issue showed interest in TRPA guidelines and were unaware that caps were a potential solution. They suggested that future discussions might explore other limitations, such as restricting the number of STRs on a street or requiring them to be spaced a certain distance apart, potentially opening the door for further action.

Chris Wood added to the discussion, emphasizing that Commissioner Hill is highly engaged with the workforce housing issue, having secured funding for studies that inform decisions on the matter. During their meeting, Hill listened respectfully to the community's concerns, occasionally commenting, and demonstrated her active involvement in addressing the issue. Chris noted that he would submit a one-page memorandum summarizing her comments before the next meeting and would share it with Chair Diane Becker to ensure accuracy of the comments.

Diane Becker added that during their discussions with the Commissioners, none seemed to fully grasp the need to raise funds, possibly from the Transient Occupancy Tax (TOT) or other sources, to create a comprehensive workforce housing plan. She noted that this was highlighted in a 2021 study Commissioner Hill referenced. Diane expressed hope that a solid, funded plan could be developed, moving beyond current efforts like deed restrictions and inclusionary housing incentives. She emphasized the importance of getting all Commissioners on board with this approach to address workforce housing effectively.

Kevin Lyons shared updates regarding siren systems, referencing his conversations with companies like Omni Warn and Federal Signal during a conference in Texas. These companies, experienced in deploying sirens for tornado warnings in the Midwest, have technology that could be useful for emergency alerts in the area. The range of these sirens is typically 1 to 3 miles, depending on how they are deployed. Additionally, Kevin announced that he would be conducting a training session at the upcoming GID meeting on Wednesday. The session, part of his Citizen Academy training, focuses on myths about government and offers insights into the complexities of public service, highlighting situations where well-intentioned actions can be illegal for officials. The training is designed to be both entertaining and informative for elected officials, staff, and residents. Roxanna asked if the first hour was open to the public. Kevin responded that from 6-7 the meeting is open to the public and free, at the Chateau this Wednesday.

Denise Davis reminded that the Community Forum will not be meeting this Friday because there are five Fridays in March, but will reconvene on the first Friday in April.

Diane Becker noted there being a TRPA meeting on Wednesday for those that want to attend.

1. **GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT**

Yolanda Knaak expressed concern about the lack of affordable rental housing for local workers, noting that while many may not have the 20% down payment required to buy a home, they often have enough to rent. She was disappointed by a zoning change that shifted a project from rentals to condos, specifically mentioning the development at 947 Tahoe Boulevard. She emphasized that rentals would have been more beneficial for workforce housing in the area.

Tim Delaney expressed concerns about the location of schools near Mount Rose Highway, stating that it's inappropriate to place schools there without proper buffer zones and infrastructure for emergencies. He emphasized the need for safe traffic flow and shelter for children during crises. He also warned about potential issues with insurance, noting that increased development could make insurance companies wary of the risks, citing similar challenges in the Santa Cruz Mountains. He suggested that alternative methods like space communications might be better for alerting the community during emergencies

Doug Flaherty raised concerns about the proposed East Shore extension Trail “2” along Highway 28, connecting Sand Harbor to Cave Rock. He criticized the environmental assessment process, calling it inadequate, and warned of significant opposition due to potential environmental impacts and overuse, citing figures of 1,000 to 3,200 visitors per day. He also discussed the need for thorough analysis regarding fireworks displays in the Tahoe area, including their impact on air and water quality, wildlife, and debris. Flaherty emphasized the importance of data and responsible participation in public discussions about these projects.

Kathy Julian expressed her support for the CAB's work on the evacuation letter and highlighted the need for professionally managed rental housing, especially for service workers in the area. She cautioned against the focus on incentivizing developers to build for-purchase housing, arguing that the priority should be on providing rental units for essential workers. While acknowledging that some professionals also struggle to buy homes, she emphasized that the immediate need for the local workforce is rental housing rather than ADUs or for-purchase condos.

**ADJOURNMENT -** Adjourned at 7:36 p.m.